Association for Written Language and Literacy Ассоциация письменного языка и письменности Ένωση για τη γραπτη γλώσσα και τη βασική εκπαίδευση 书面语言和识字协会 Association for Written Language and Literacy



#### Easy decoding yet difficult encoding

# What does the asymmetry between reading and writing in Korean Hangul mean for grapholinguistics?

Hye Pae, Ph.D.

University of Cincinnati U.S.A

#### The Korean alphabet, Hangu CINCINNATI

- "... one of the most scientifically designed and efficient scripts in the world" (King, 1996, p. 219).
- "The Korean script is a true alphabet in the Greek sense; the simplest and most perfectly systematic of all alphabets" (Hope, 1959, p. 158).
- "Hangul must surely rank as one of the great intellectual achievements of Mankind" (Sampson, 2015, p. 165).
- "[Hangul is] simple, elegant and more systematically structured than any other writing system" (Coulmas, 1996, p. 458).
- "In its simplicity, efficiency and elegance, this alphabet is alphabet's epitome, a star among alphabets, a national treasure for Koreans..." (Man, 2000, p. 109).
- "...perhaps the most scientific system of writing in general use in any country" (Reischauer & Fairbank, 1969, p. 435, cited in Sampson, 2015, p. 143).
- "...the world's best alphabet" (Vos, 1964, p. 31, cited in Sampson, 2015, p. 143).
- "... the transition from syllable to phoneme is [an] enormous feat of abstraction, which may have been accomplished only once in history" (Hannas, 1997, p. 57).





Allen Williams (2000)



#### **Errors** made by a Former President

- Four errors in spelling, spacing, and participle misuse:
- 번영된 조국 [awkward expression], 평화통일을 이루는데 [이루는 데] 모든것을 [모든 것을] 받치겠읍니다 [바치겠습니다] (June 6, 2007)
- Three errors in spelling, spacing, and tense:
- 이나라 [이 나라] 강산을 사랑 하시는 [하시던] 문학의 큰별께서 고히 [고이] 잠드소서 (May 6, 2008).
- Two errors in spelling and spacing:
- 반드시 경제살리고 [경제 살리고], 사회통합 이루어 님들의 숭고한 희생정신을 살려서, 크게 보답하겠읍니다 [보답하겠습니다] (October 22, 2007)
- Two errors in particle misuse and spacing:
- 3.15정신으로 이땅에 [이 땅에] 진정한 민주화와 국가번영을[국가 번영이] 이루어지기 기원합니다" (March 23, 2007)



# Outline

- The Korean alphabet
  - Phonography: HunMinJeongEum
  - Why is spelling difficult?
- Science of Writing: Grapholinguistics in Hangul
- Future Directions of Korean Grapholinguistics





## Outline

- The Korean alphabet
  - Phonography: HunMinJeongEum
  - Why is spelling difficult?
- Science of Writing: Grapholinguistics in Hangul
- Future Directions of Korean Grapholinguistics





## The Korean Alphabet

- Purposely invented by King Sejong in 1443/1444
  - To combat illiteracy
  - To standardize the pronunciation of Chinese characters
- Phonetic Alphabet or Shallow Phonography
- HunMinJeongEum



 Literally meaning "the Standard Sound for Instructing the People"

#### An Unwelcomed Script



- Was initially not dismissed by the ruling class because it was too easy to learn to read
  - "If it is so easy to learn to read, who is going to painstakingly learn the true writing [Chinese characters]?"
  - Threat to Knowledge Monopoly & the Status Quo
- Was called by elites
  - Vernacular Script
  - Women's Script
  - Children's Script
  - Systematically ignored until the 20th century



#### Used by Women and Ordinary People

• A letter written by a women to a deceased husband on June 1, 1586 (found in 1998)





#### Women's Literacy





# What makes Hangul easy to learn to read?

- Consistent sound-symbol correspondence
- Systematic C-V combination
- Syllabic block

 $\longrightarrow \begin{cases} Learnability \text{ for emergent readers} \\ Efficiency \text{ for skilled readers} \end{cases}$ 



#### **Stroke Addition Rule**









	Vovels	- F	•	4	-	Т	<u>.</u>	т	π	-	1
Consonants	Pron.	diam 1	<u>yan</u>	young	225/70	<u>eb</u>	Yoput	P00	<u>yeu</u>	bl <u>eo</u> rie	2 <u>88</u> 2
<b>_</b>	0	$\neg \models$	71	계	거	32	足	구	규	Э	기
	N	각	4	- 14	녀	노	노	누	Ŧ	느	ч
E	D	다	댜	0	0(	도	도	두	튜	트	의
a	LIR.	라	라	8	8	愿	로	早	류	黑	리
D	м	- 10	пţ	머	a	모	묘	4	쮸	<u> </u>	미
ы	8	нŀ	ыţ	8	버	보	브	부	쀼	브	비
~	6	사	사	서	4	소	\$	<b></b>	슈	≙	ч
0	ing	0	0):	어	여	오	오	平	유	<u>0</u>	0
×	Ļ	자	자	저	저	迩	×	주	쥬	×	지
*	Ch	차	챠	채	치	초	魚	奉	砕	土	치
-	ĸ	카	거	거	커	灵	豆	무	큐	Е	키
е	т	타	타	е	8	蕉	55.	루	류	<u>.</u>	티
ш	P	파	퍄	폐	퍼	포	亜	۴	쮸	Ξ	퍼
÷	н	6	햐	혀	혀	호	意	4	÷	直	혀



# Loss of Historical Documents & Ban on the Korean Alphabet

- King YeonSanGun banned Hangul use in 1504
  - A petition written in Hangul criticizing the tyranny of the king
  - Incinerated all books written in Hangul
- Japanese imperialism  $(1910 \sim 1945)$ 
  - The public's name changes from Korean to Japanese
  - Textbooks written and instruction delivered in Japanese



#### Necessity of Orthographic Reform

#### $16C \sim 20C$

#### Phonological Drift Inertia







# The Use of Space in Hangul

- In the original alphabet, no space was used
- Several experiments:
  - 쥐가.마당에서.돌아.다니면서.ᄯㅓㄹ어진.쌀을.주어.먹소 (Song, 2014, p. 127)
  - 그。다음에。기결에의。난틀을。말하겟노라 (Song, 2014, p. 128)
  - 홀°로。나°는。소리°를。이름°이니라 (Song, 2014, p. 128)
- First introduced in the *Independent Newspaper* on April 7, 1896



# Debate: Block Writing vs. Linear Writing

- Examples:
  - 우리 나라가 밝고 곱다
  - ㅇㅜㄹㅣ ㄴㅏㄹㅏ ㄱㅏ ㅂㅏㄹㄱ ㄱㅗ ㄱㅗㅂ ㄷㅏ
- Western Influences
- Typewriters



#### Mixed Scripts within a sentence

- Hangul Only - 유구한 역사와 전통에 빛나는 우리 대한민국
- Mixed Scripts
  - 悠久한 歷史와 傳統에 빛나는 우리 大韓民國



# Outline

- The Korean alphabet
  - Phonography
  - Why is spelling difficult?
- Science of Writing: Grapholinguistics in Hangul
- Future Directions of Korean Grapholinguistics



#### The Science of Writing: Grapholinguistics



- "Grapholinguistics is young, and it is in a state of flux" (Meletis, 2020, p. 403)
- "... the linguistic sub discipline dealing with the scientific study of all aspects of written language" (Neef, 2015, p. 711)
- "... the interdisciplinary field focused on the study of all aspects of writing" (Meletis & Dürscheid, 2022, p. 2)





# Grapholinguistics

• The study of the relationship between writing systems and the languages they represent



#### **Graphematic Functions of Hangul**





# **Optimal Orthography**

• "An efficient writing system must do two things simultaneously: represent sound and meaning" (Share, 2014, p. 3).

Decipherability for emergent readers Automatizability/Unitizability for skilled readers

#### Hangul

*Learnability* for emergent readers *Efficiency* for skilled readers



# **Typology of Writing Systems**



• "... a short list of simple one-word names, like *alphabet*, *abjad* and *abugida*, does not capture the full range of segmental scripts or the relationships between them" (Gnanadesikan, 2017, p. 14, emphasis in original)

# Hangul: A Multifaceted Scriptersity of CINCINNATI

- Alphabet: Alphabetic Principle
- Featural script (Sampson, 2015)
  - "an ugly term, but no better alternative is available" (p. 33)
- A "fully vowelled syllabically arranged featural segmentary" (Meletis & Dürscheid, 2020, p. 224)
- Alphasyllabary (Taylor & Taylor, 2014)
- Alphabetic Syllabary (Pae, 2011)
- Morphosyllabic Alphabet (Pae, Bae, & Yi, 2020; Pae, 2023)
  - Both inflectional and derivational morphemes are represented at the syllable level
  - Alphabetic Principle



# New Perspectives on Hangul

(Gnanadesikan, 2017; Meletis, 2020; Meletis & Dürscheid, 2022)

"Korean graphemes are not segmental but subsegmental as they are combined with other graphemes to form combinations of graphemes, combinations which then occupy a segmental space and correspond with phonological syllables" (Meletis & Dürscheid, 2022, p. 132)

- Syllabic Blocks: graphetically segmental
  - Graphemes: subsegmental



## Syllabic Block in Hangul

Why did King Sejong adopt syllabic blocks?



The syllabic block was to be "in accord with the appearance of the **prestigious Chinese script**" (Daniels, 2017, p. 83, emphasis added)

"The organizational principle of the frame in Chinese is so strong that all other East Asian writing systems that have been influenced by Chinese... make script use of an **idealized square**" (Tranter, 2013, p. 5, emphasis added)



#### Syllable Block for Dual Practical Purposes:

- 1) Easy Learning to Read
- 2) Syllable-for-Syllable Interlinear Gloss for Chinese
- 유구한 역사와 전통에 빛나는 우리 대한민국
- 悠久한 歷史와 傳統에 빛나는 우리 大韓民國
- om¬Tゔトレo╡ㄱㅅトo⊥トㅈㅓレㅌㅗ ooㅔㅂㅣㅊㄴトㄴㅡㄴoㅜㄹㅣㄷㅐゔト ㄴㅁㅣㄴㄱㅜㄱ



# Decoding vs. Encoding



# Decoding ⇔ Encoding in Hangul

#### Segmental Level

- Letter Sound Mapping
- Sound Letter Mapping

# Shallow Shallow

#### Lexical Level

- Word Speech Mapping
- Speech Word Mapping

Morpheme

Shallow

 $\neq$  Shallow



"Thus, the analysis of mistakes or, less prescriptively phrased, users' deviance from prevalent orthographic norms, is an important part of graphematic research" (Meletis & Dürscheid, 2022, p. 119)



#### **Errors** made by a Former President

- Four errors in spelling, spacing, and participle misuse:
- 번영된 조국 [awkward expression], 평화통일을 이루는데 [이루는 데] 모든것을 [모든 것을] 받치겠읍니다 [바치겠습니다] (June 6, 2007)
- Three errors in spelling, spacing, and tense:
- 이나라 [이 나라] 강산을 사랑 하시는 [하시던] 문학의 큰별께서 고히 [고이] 잠드소서 (May 6, 2008).
- Two errors in spelling and spacing:
- 반드시 경제살리고 [경제 살리고], 사회통합 이루어 님들의 숭고한 희생정신을 살려서, 크게 보답하겠읍니다 [보답하겠습니다] (October 22, 2007)
- Two errors in particle misuse and spacing:
- 3.15정신으로 이땅에 [이 땅에] 진정한 민주화와 국가번영을[국가 번영이] 이루어지기 기원합니다" (March 23, 2007)



#### A Korean linguist's bemoaning

현행 形態表記를 一般用으로 계속 밀고 나아간다면, 一般은 제 國語조차 옳게 쓰는 사람이 별로 없다는 아주 심각한 상태에 직면하지 않겠는가?"

(translation: If you keep moving forward with the current morphemic notations for general use, aren't you going to encounter a somber reality that only a few people can spell their own native language accurately?) (M.S. Kim, 1987, p. 13).



# Outline

- The Korean alphabet
  - Phonography
  - Why is spelling difficult?
- Science of Writing: Grapholinguistics in Hangul
- Future Directions of Korean Grapholinguistics





#### Grapholinguistics

• A reassessment of the existing taxonomy



#### Scientific Modularity

- The science of reading and the science of writing are considered two distinct and separable research areas.
- Even reading and spelling have been studied independently



# From Scientific Modularity to Scientific Integration

Independence & Interdependence





#### Questions to be addressed

- Is a universal science of psycholinguistics and grapholinguistics possible?
- How do we address the discrepancy between decoding (reading) and encoding (spelling)?
- What is the proper way to test the universal validity of models established in each domain?



#### Conclusion

- Hangul has the potential to serve as a tool for studying script-universals and script-particulars in grapholiguistics
- We still know little about the internal integration of decoding and spelling in Hangul
- Systematic grapholinguistic research is needed

#### 





#### **Selected References**

- Adams, M. J. (1990). *Beginning to read: Thinking and learning about print*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.
- Meletis, D. (2020). *The nature of writing: A theory of grapholinguistics*. (Grapholinguistics and Its Applications, Vol. 3). Brest: Fluxus Editions.
- Meletis, D., & Dürscheid, C. (2022). Writing systems and their use: An overview of grapholinguistics. De Gruyter.
- Pae, H. K. (20023; in press). *Analyzing the Korean alphabet: The science of Hangul.* Springer.
- Rogers, H. (1995). Optimal orthographies. In I. Taylor & D. R. Olson (Eds.), Scripts and literacy: Reading and learning to read alphabets, syllabaries and characters (pp. 31-43). Boston, MA: Kluwer Academic.
- Sampson, Sampson, G. (2015). Writing systems (2nd ed.). Bristol, CT: Equinox.
- Share, D. L. (2014). Alphabetism in reading science. *Frontiers in Psychology, 5* (Article 752), 1-4.
- Share, D. L. (2021). Is the science of reading just the science of reading English? *Reading Research Quarterly, 56(S1),* 391-402.